

Cebu Shelter Cluster | Workshop - From Strategy to Operational Framework - REPORT



SUMMARY:

Rationale: To contribute to Shelter Cluster national process to operationalize further its strategy, membership at hub level need to define the priorities roadmap for post emergency shelter response in Cebu province for short & medium term. To do so, a workshop will be organised on Friday 10 January to provide recommendations to 3 key issues:

(1) What are the prioritized building back better / safer activities, and programming options for remaining emergency shelter, and support to self recovery shelter response. It must reflect on households and communities priorities, Strategic Response Plan objectives , available resources and actual implementation capacity of shelter actors.

(2) How to maximise coordination of strategy implementation. It must reflect on Provincial Government, LGUs and Shelter Cluster coordination framework.

(3) Where to prioritize emergency and self recovery shelter response. It must reflect on enhancing gaps coverage and equity of the response.

Date: Friday 10 January

Place: Borbon municipal session hall

Time: 9AM to 3:30PM

The workshop was attended by 130+ people for morning sessions and 118 for afternoon sessions, with 3 groups (1) Cebu province Shelter Cluster membership -18 , (2) provincial, municipal and local authorities - 46, (3) disaster affected communities and households - 58.

The workshop was chaired Ms Evelyn Senajon, Officer in Charge, Provincial Social Welfare and Development Office, Provincial Shelter Cluster chair and Paglic-on Task Force Shelter Sector Head

It was co facilitated by Baltz Tribunalo, Paglic-on Task Force coordinator – Xavier Génot Shelter Cluster coordinator for Cebu, James Shepherd Barron, National Shelter Cluster Coordinator & Maarten Van Der Veen, Shelter Cluster Information Manager

Key reference documents were sent in advance and printed out for participants consultation, on top of last information management products for Cebu province and other Shelter Cluster material: REACH assessment factsheet - Shelter cluster Strategic Response Plan - Shelter Cluster, Manila: Typhoon Yolanda / Haiyan - 5 January 2014, From Strategy to Operational Framework

Expected Outputs, recommendations on:

OUTPUT 1: How to implement the strategy? What are the prioritized options to support self recovery?

OUTPUT 2: How to build back Safer better? What are the prioritized activities?

OUTPUT 3: What are the critical issues & bottlenecks? How to overcome them?

OUTPUT 4: How and where to target shelter assistance? How to prioritize?



AGENDA

9:00 Registration

9:20 Welcome note by Borbon Mayor, Mister Hon. Bernard A. Sepulveda

9:30 Introductions by Evelyn Senajon

9:45 Workshop introduction & modalities, by Baltz Tribunalo & Xavier Génot

10:00 From Strategy to Operational Framework, by James Shepherd Barron

10:20 Cebu province, update on Shelter response by Xavier Génot & Maarten Van Der Veen

10:40 REACH assessment key findings, by James Shepherd Barron

11:00 Relocation/rehousing LTHIA project for informal settlers in Mandaue city in response to 2007 fire, process and lessons learned, by Bryan Auman, architect San Carlos university and PACSII representative

12:00 to 12:45 lunch

12:45 to 14:15: 3 parallel groups discussions:

- Group 1: Households & communities priorities and support to sheltering process– facilitation by Baltz Tribunalo
- Group 2: Coordination and operationalization of the strategy for Cebu province – facilitation by Evelyn Senajon
- Group 3: Planned activities and menu of programming options – facilitation by James Shepherd Barron

14:15 to 14:30: Coffee break and groups wrap up

14:30 to 15:00: Groups restitution and recommendations – facilitation by Xavier Génot

15:00 to 15:30: Conclusions and wrap up, by Evelyn Senajon and James Shepherd Barron

OUTPUTS MATRIX

This Matrix was used all the day to capture inputs from morning sessions discussions and by the 3 focus groups discussion during break out groups.

Group 1 – Household and Communities - 58 persons (females - 41; males – 17) – Main facilitator Baltz Tribunalo

Group 2- LGUs – 42 persons – Main facilitator Ms Evelyn Senajon

Group 3 – Shelter agencies – Main facilitator James Shepherd Barron

Output 1 – How to implement the strategy? What are the prioritized options to support self recovery?			
Programming Options	(1) Household and Communities	(2) Provincial, Municipal and Local Authorities	(3) Shelter agencies
Retrofitting and repairing (distribution of roofing materials, fixings, tool kits)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Gauge 22 GI sheets ▪ Proper foundation ▪ Setbacks ▪ Riprap ▪ Steel truss ▪ Site location (mangrove, mountain) ▪ Standard materials available in the locality for easier transport (coco lumber, bamboo, nipa, limestone) 	<p>How? Conduct survey, validation and evaluation of affected families, identification of clients (indigent status), prioritization of housing materials distribution particularly with already obvious counterpart of house owners in terms of house repairs</p> <p>Priority options: Identification of totally and partially damage houses then, prioritizing the indigent “poorest among the poor” affected families (<i>servicing 1st the totally damage houses then, partially</i>)</p> <p><i>Note: All or at least majority of municipalities have distributed roofing materials</i></p>	One partner reported to use 40 hurricane straps, longer than the original.
Rebuilding (distribution of roofing materials, fixings, tool kits) Technical assistance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Setback (If the house is built within the riverbanks or 20-40 meter easement) ▪ Willing to pay the monthly amortization (e.g P150.00/month) provided it is within the barangay which the affected families is residing ▪ Relocation site must be provided with access to basic services (water, electricity, livelihood, roads, health and sanitation, education) 	<p>How? Conduct survey, validation and evaluation of affected families, identification of clients (indigent status), prioritization of affected families (<i>indigent status, must be totally damage houses, displaced & risk area households</i>); house standardization in terms of design to ensure earthquake and typhoon resilience for longer life span of structures</p> <p>Priority options: provision of relocation sites and ensure technical guidance as to systems and mechanisms in rebuilding/house construction for permanent structures and maintenance</p> <p>NOTE: 1. Priority is the relocation sites. 2.</p>	

		<i>determine totally damaged houses</i>	
Cash Grants (unconditional)		<p>How? donor agencies conduct of survey, validation and evaluation among potential beneficiaries identified by LGUs</p> <p>Priority options: depends on the donor agencies and agreements with LGUs if passes/coordinating with them prior to its implementation of assistance</p> <p><i>NOTE: Private donors will be given to people with private donations. The municipalities recommends unconditional over conditional cash. The poorest have to be targeted by the municipality.</i></p>	Unconditional cash grants preferred by the community
Cash Grants (conditional)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Cash transfer must have sets of conditions 	<p>How? donor agencies conduct of survey, validation and evaluation among potential beneficiaries identified by LGUs; implementation of grants as per set guidelines by donor agencies; collaboration and coordination by both (<i>donor agencies and LGUs</i>)</p> <p>Priority options: depends on the donor agencies and agreements with LGUs e.g. <i>cleaning of debris, house construction, carpentry trainings/workshops, etc.</i></p>	
Host family support or rental assistance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Allow the affected families to stay without pay 	<p>How? Not existing</p> <p>Priority options: NOT existing</p>	
Transitional shelter (construction)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Ongoing construction 	<p>How? Conduct survey, validation and evaluation of affected families, identification of clients (indigent status), prioritization of affected families (<i>indigent status, must be</i></p>	A permanent house costs no more than 10% more than a transitional house at c.\$30 per m ² , so why do T-shelter?

		<p><i>totally damage houses, bigger number of family members, with pregnant women, PWDs and senior citizens, displaced & risk area households)</i></p> <p>Priority options: <i>provision of shelter box kits, tools and tarpaulins</i></p>	<p>Need to define what we mean by types of shelter (emergency, transitional, self-recovered, incremental (core room), durable)</p> <p>Partners are not sure whether to build temporary shelter and rebuild these, or to move to permanent shelter.</p>
Progression (core) Shelter (construction)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Need additional help (construction materials) 	<p>How? <i>Conduct survey, validation and evaluation of affected families, identification of clients (indigent status), prioritization of affected families (indigent status, must be totally damage houses, displaced & risk area households)</i></p> <p>Priority options: <i>provision of shelter box kits and tools to identified beneficiaries with already obvious counterpart of house owners in terms of housing materials</i></p>	<p>Need to define what we mean by types of shelter (emergency, transitional, self-recovered, incremental (core room), durable)</p>
Permanent House (construction)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No more transitional, they prefer for permanent housing 	<p>How? <i>Conduct survey, validation and evaluation of affected families, identification of clients (indigent status), prioritization of affected families (indigent status, must be totally damage houses, displaced & risk area households); documents presentation (proof of ownership) and proof of agreement (affidavit of consent) of land owner for house construction. Priority options: construction of permanent house to onsite and relocation sites to identified beneficiaries (agreed by both: Donor agencies and LGUs)</i></p> <p><i>NOTE: The government want the participation</i></p>	<p>Need to define what we mean by types of shelter (emergency, transitional, self-recovered, incremental (core room), durable)</p> <p>Now need TWiG on permanent housing</p> <p>Permanent houses could serve as an example for local industry, especially if you provide trainings to the construction companies. The long lasting effects are much bigger than is normally expected.</p>

		<p><i>of the household in the construction.</i></p> <p><i>The law also specifies what can be done in shelter. An example is the no-build zone.</i></p>	
Other/comment	<p>Priorities (1)Housing (2) Lot ownership (3) Water and sanitation (4) Electricity (5) Livelihood (6) Education</p> <p>Communities want to pay for land and house. They would want a certificate.</p> <p>The communities wants to receive products that have been counted and only receive quality products. Corruption on this level should be avoided</p> <p>For temporary Shelter: GI Sheets (roofing) and wood (lumber)</p> <p>Tools needed for carpentry works: Nails / Hammer / Chisel / Saw</p>	<p>There should always be coordination among LGUs (City/Mun. and Barangay level) and donor agencies in terms of ASSISTANCE implementation in order to avoid duplication of assistance, political biases, unfair distribution of benefits to affected families and inhumane practices.</p>	<p>Beneficiaries and suppliers unfamiliar with hurricane straps</p> <p>Umbrella roofing nails for CGI should be twisted shank</p> <p>8" Nails too long</p> <p>8x4 ft 26g (0.4mm) CGI sheet costs c.PhP220, and the price is stable. Supplies are short, however, with suppliers preferring the higher prices in Tacloban</p> <p>CGI sheets for use in coastal areas <u>must</u> be pre-painted (preferable) or painted in situ (annually), to prevent rot within two or three years. If the latter, partners should include paint in the SSR kit. A coloured sheet is also a bit cooler.</p> <p>Locally produced <i>Amakan</i> (woven bamboo) matting used for walls is in short supply and will need to imported from other areas of the Philippines. Consider a role for the Chamber of Commerce</p>

			<p>Cash-for-Work applies standard rates of PhP 270 per day. Municipality pays PhP 170 per day for unskilled labour.</p> <p>Four-sided roofing is more wind-resistant than two-sided. Overhangs are usually far too long. Need technical drawings of the optimum hurricane-resistant roof design</p> <p>Nippa thatching is viable inland, but not tiling with nippa shingle. Fired caly tiles are too heavy and should be discouraged</p> <p>It is important to compare against the baseline. In some cases a shelter is already much better than the existing house.</p>
Output 2 – How to build back Safer better? What are the prioritized activities?			
Building back better	(1) Household and Communities	(2) Provincial, Municipal and Local Authorities	(3) Shelter agencies

Resource centers at community or municipal level	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Relocation site consideration <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Geological survey ▪ Drug free community ▪ Peace and order (safety and security) ▪ Livelihood ▪ Disaster awareness ▪ With evacuation sites in case of emergency/ calamity 	<p>How? Meet & communicate standards & national policies; resilience to earthquake and typhoons</p> <p>Priority activities: conduct survey, validation, evaluation and prioritization of resource center's assistance</p>	
Training for carpenters and other skilled workers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Cash for work ▪ Cash for training ▪ Need skilled workers 	<p>How? conduct of training to carpenters and other skilled workers through close coordination to TESDA; monitoring of beneficiaries (carpenters and skilled workers) and assessment of activity impact</p> <p>Priority activities: discussion with the Mayors, other key players of LGUs and donor agencies and inventory of skilled workers within the locality; actual training of carpenters; provision of carpentry tool kits to trained carpenters; utilization of trained carpenters for house construction and rebuilding of houses and schools</p>	<p>The priority is to scale up training of master carpenters and masons as per TESDA project. The STEER project in CEBU: skills training and emergency employment towards recovery in Northern Cebu</p> <p>Some agency has trained local unexperienced people to make shelters. Local families help with carrying materials.</p> <p>However, basic local carpentry skills are considered good</p>
Training-orientation to beneficiaries	Communities want to be trained at the community level to avoid transport costs	<p>How? small, group and community discussions to identified target beneficiaries; monitoring and assessment of activity impact</p> <p>Priority activities: identification of</p>	

		beneficiaries, selection and prioritization	
Community awareness and mobilization campaigns (Vulnerability and Capacity Assessments, Participatory methodologies on Safe Shelter)	Community wants a early warning system. Also, they want the rebuild sheet to be distributed to all community members.	How? community advocacy and awareness orientations Priority activities: community meetings, consultations	Better dissemination of how to build back better to the communities.
Distribution of posters, flyers and other printed materials		How? Priority activities: lay-out and finalization of design; printing and distribution to target recipients	
Messaging through other media such as radio or SMS			The partners are not involved in messaging on radio. Partners are not ready for it.
Land tenure legal assistance	needed		There are many islands that are so small that everyone lives in the no build zone. Where to handle these cases? The partners would like to appeal to the rule of the no build zone.

Other /comment	Tenants of the Hacienda residing in the area – wont transfer to the relocation site; persons with highly respective in the locality together with the owner of the lot to conduct meeting or dialogue with the tenants discussing the issues related to the importance of transferring to the relocation site	The municipalities should be involved in the discussion on minimum housing standards	<p>From REACH: We should assume that those that say they “don’t need additional support” perhaps don’t know what is required to build back safer</p> <p>It would help if IEC materials were clearer and more detailed (e.g for footing/foundation where some are using sump oil to prevent rot), with separate (plastic) sheets (A4) for each design feature</p> <p>Need to look at ‘minimum build back safer’ standards i.e better than what was there before</p> <p>Build limited number of higher quality houses, and then wait as people will copy on their own</p> <p>Local people have houses with two slope roofing. It should however be four slope roofing. A minimum standard for sheltering is needed. Partners need some information on technical issues, standards and cultural standards.</p>
----------------	---	--	---

Output 3 – What are the critical issues and bottlenecks? How to overcome them?

Critical Issues	(1) Household and Communities	(2) Provincial, Municipal and Local Authorities	(3) Shelter agencies
Housing, land and property rights	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Want to get the certification from the landowners of the lot and donor since we are willing to pay based on the agreed payment and capacities 	<p>Critical issues/bottlenecks? Bias selection of beneficiaries, relocations sites far from sources of livelihood and very small housing sizes</p> <p>How to overcome? accessibility, provision of basic commodities, access to livelihood activities</p>	

WASH for shelter	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No problem with water supply 	<p>Critical issues/bottlenecks? Absence and inconsideration of WASH concern upon the construction of houses</p> <p>How to overcome? IEC, adopt proper interventions; talk to line agencies related to WASH concerns; debris recycling; cash for work program</p>	<p>Houses are being rebuilt with no WASH i.e no water supply and no toilet</p> <p>Shelter is not shelter without a toilet and access to safe drinking water. How to handle the issue that some houses are not damaged, but totally not up to minimum standards? Some flexibility in the standards is required. The minimum housing standards should keep in mind the dignity of the most vulnerable</p>
Cash programming	Set of conditions related to shelter supports	<p>Critical issues/bottlenecks? unconditional funding/assistance allocation must be less as compared to conditional in order to assure impact of help; bias selection of beneficiaries</p> <p>How to overcome? LGU coordination and discussions; non-political engagement or involvement (<i>assistance must be based on assessed persons in need</i>)</p>	Wages vary greatly among agencies. Some have to provide city wages.
Debris recycling	Maximized what has been left after the typhoon and use them for the shelter construction	<p>Critical issues/bottlenecks? Limited knowledge for the utilization of debris or recycling</p> <p>How to overcome? orientation on the importance of debris recycling, training and capacity building activities (debris recycling)</p>	Would like to recycle debris
Environment	Protect the environment but insure that they will not contribute to risks or disasters like branches must be pruned before the typhoon and fruit trees must be planted	<p>Critical issues/bottlenecks? illegal logging, over-use of resources, mangrove conversion; improper waste disposal; land conversion; reclamation</p> <p>How to overcome? IEC; constant advocacy on the importance of environmental protection,</p>	

		conservation and preservation; segregation; advocacy on kwarta sa basura; debris recycling orientation and trainings; marketing on debris recycling products	
Gender and diversity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Role of women must be respected as well as children in terms of shelter construction processes, defined roles must be agreed like cooking, firewood gathering and even in actual housing construction 	<p>Critical issues/bottlenecks? No privacy; poor gender sensitivity</p> <p>How to overcome? adoption of housing construction standards; advocacy on gender responsiveness, issues and concerns;</p>	ILO is running cash for work programs with 30% women, 70% men.
Accessibility	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Compliance of BP 344 (Accessibility Law) in the design preparation and construction ▪ Always considering the limitations of PWD's 	<p>Critical issues/bottlenecks? absence of PWD and senior citizen accessibility</p> <p>How to overcome? advocacy on senior citizens and PWDs rights and mandate; accessibility law implementation</p>	
Technical guidance/standards on engineered solutions	Technical supports from the donors or universities like USC etc and do the training at the communities level		
Technical and communication guidance for Building Back Better and Safer shelter awareness	IEC materials like the techniques of building construction, guidelines and easy to read or follow housing constructions considering the identified hazards in the communities		
Host families	Training and community based approaches on DRR like disaster preparedness and early warning systems, letting them also part of community engagement as to risk reduction works		
Beneficiary	Community consultation and		

communication and community engagement	participation in terms of build back better and well enlightened decisions to insure safety and climate change adaptation		
Training	Community based and easy to understand works on resilience		
Shelter material availability	Local available goods but of quality materials		Local suppliers don't know what a hurricane strap is. Twisted nails are unavailable. It is getting easier to find some materials. But for instance the preferred CGI sheeting is difficult to get. Many agencies are procuring from CEBU suppliers, because they move faster. Presence of partners has changed the markets (locals now get materials for higher prices)
Shelter material quality	Quality check and must be available in the market and always in consonance to the national standards		
Coco lumber	To be maximized but only the old grown coconuts and at the same time with lower or negotiated price	<i>Critical issues/bottlenecks?</i> permit to transport compliance; overpricing; scarcity of supply <i>How to overcome?</i> ask/negotiate PCA for the exemption of permit compliance to affected individuals;	Coco lumber is everywhere. Should be considered. It can be cut quite precisely by chainsaw.
Other /comment	Participatory approach in the selection process to avoid conflict		What is the definition of totally versus partially damaged houses? Newer NGO partners – some quite large – are finding it difficult to register with SEC (Security Agency). Without the SEC certificate, they

			<p>can't get bank accounts. And, without bank accounts they can't transfer cash. Doing everything on their own credit cards at the moment.</p> <p>This implies that taxes and/or import duties etc are paid on locally procured materials</p> <p>It needs to be made clear that a household in receipt of NGO support should not be penalized when it comes to restitution/compensation by DSWD</p> <p>Funding for Cebu Province disproportionately low</p> <p>The strategy for emergency-self recovery – recovery is blurred</p> <p>Data needs to be disaggregated by Region, Province, and Municipality Definition of “total” and “partial” damage needed</p> <p>There is only 1 emergency shelter provided for displaced people. Those are people from Tacloban.</p>
--	--	--	---

Output 4 – How and where to target shelter assistance? How to prioritize			
Targeting Shelter assistance	(1) Household and Communities	(2) Provincial, Municipal and Local Authorities	(3) Shelter agencies

	<p>The communities have to be consulted to decide who are the beneficiaries</p> <p>Prioritization criteria samples in choosing the beneficiaries:</p> <p>in the re-construction of houses, due to financial constraints, only 20 HHs of the 58 HHs</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Totally Damaged ✓ Poorest of the poor <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ household size with siblings below 7 years old ○ PWDs/Elderly/ Pregnant Women ○ Head of the family with no means of income or meager income ○ HHs in the hazardous/flood prone area (20 meter easement and along the riverbank) ○ Recommended by the small community or porok where the beneficiary belong ○ All the chosen families will be posted and have at least a week posted in the community area for public consultation and other scrutinizes ○ Will agree to match and volunteer to works for the construction 	<p>How and where to target shelter assistance? Identification as to indigent status; lot availability; depends on the guidelines of donor agencies</p> <p>How to prioritize? Based from the poorest among the poor; Brgys. with small number of affected families; adopt-a-barangay system</p>	<p>Communities adamant that the “poorest of the poor” should be supported first</p> <p>Beneficiary selection criteria still opaque and need to be clarified</p> <p>Agencies should discuss with the local municipality to find an area to work in. Agencies should not only select on the most damaged houses, but also consider the most vulnerable</p> <p>UN OCHA finds it very unclear who the beneficiaries should be and the real numbers.</p> <p>Partners feel the emergency phase is over. This is generally very fast. There is still a part of the effected communities that have not received aid.</p>
	<p>Problems on sanitary toilet – how to address</p>		
	<p>Transparency and accountability in the implementation of the reconstruction of shelter</p> <p>To work against corruptions to insure trust and confidence from the donors and local government.</p>		